THE
MODERN LAW REVIEW

General Editor
PROFESSOR S. A. ROBERTS
LL.B., PH.D.

VOLUME 52

London
STEVENS & SONS LIMITED
1989

Published for the Proprietors The Modern Law Review Ltd. by Stevens & Sons Ltd. South Quay Plaza, 183 Marsh Wall, London and printed in Great Britain by The Eastern Press Ltd. Reading

ISBN 0 420 48420 5

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the copyright holder and the publisher, application for which shall be made to the publisher.

©

Modern Law Review Limited

London 1989

EDITORIAL BOARD

PROFESSOR M. R. CHESTERMAN, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.

PROFESSOR R. G. DAHRENDORF, DR.PHIL., PH.D., D.LITT., LITT.D., LL.D., D.SC., DR.UNIV., M.R.I.A., F.R.C.S., F.B.A., F.R.S.A.

PROFESSOR GERALD DWORKIN, LL.B.

HIS EXCELLENCY JUDGE T. O. ELIAS, Q.C., B.A., LL.M., PH.D., LL.D.

PROFESSOR J. M. EVANS, B.A., B.C.L.

THE RT. HON. LORD FLETCHER, LL.D.

PROFESSOR L. C. B. GOWER, M.B.E., LL.M., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR J. A. G. GRIFFITH, LL.M., LL.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR H. L. A. HART, M.A., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR LORD MCGREGOR OF DURRIS, B.SC.(ECON.)

HARVEY MCGREGOR, Q.C., M.A., D.C.L., S.J.D.

I. G. PATEL, B.A., PH.D.

PROFESSOR GLANVILLE WILLIAMS, Q.C., PH.D., LL.D., F.B.A.

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

J. S. ANDERSON, LL.B., B.C.L.

PROFESSOR W. R. CORNISH, LL.B., B.C.L., F.B.A.

JUDITH FREEDMAN, M.A.

PROFESSOR CAROL HARLOW, LL.M., PH.D.

JENNY LEVIN, LL.M.

PROFESSOR MARTIN LOUGHLIN, LL.B., LL.M.

W. T. MURPHY, M.A.

PROFESSOR T. M. PARTINGTON, B.A., LL.B.

R. W. RAWLINGS, B.A., B.C.L.

PROFESSOR S. A. ROBERTS, LL.B., PH.D., *General Editor*

R. C. SIMPSON, LL.M.

PROFESSOR F. G. SNYDER, B.A., J.D., C.D.E.P.A., D.S.

PROFESSOR LORD WEDDERBURN OF CHARLTON, M.A., LL.B., F.B.A.

CONTRIBUTORS OF ARTICLES

ABEL, RICHARD L.	Between Market and State: The Legal Profession in Turmoil	285
ALEXANDER OF WEEDON, LORD	Judicial Review and City Regulators	640
ARNULL, ANTHONY	The Use and Abuse of Article 177 EEC	622
BISHOP, WILLIAM	Regulating the Market for Legal Services in England: Enforced Separation of Function and Restrictions on Forms of Enterprise	326
CAMPBELL, COLM	Extradition to Northern Ireland: Prospects and Problems	585
CANE, PETER	Economic Loss in Tort: Is the Pendulum out of Control?	200
CARTY, HAZEL	Dismissed Employees: The Search for a More Effective Range of Remedies	449
DAINTITH, TERENCE	Legal Research and Legal Values	352
EFFRON, JACK	Alternatives to Litigation: Factors in Choosing	480
FELDMAN, DAVID	The Nature of Legal Scholarship	498
HARRIS, J. W.	Unger's Critique of Formalism in Legal Reasoning: Hero, Hercules and Humdrum	42
HIGGINS, ROSALYN	Human Rights: Some Questions of Integrity*	1
KEOWN, JOHN	The Ashes of Aids and the Phoenix of Informed Consent	790
MASSON, JUDITH (co-author)	The Use of Wardship by Local Authorities	762
MORTON, SHEELAGH (co-author)	The Use of Wardship by Local Authorities	762
PITT, GWYNETH	Dismissal at Common Law: The Relevance in Britain of American Developments	22
REED, CHRIS	Authenticating Electronic Mail Messages—Some Evidential Problems	649
SEDLEY, STEPHEN	Public Inquiries: A Cure or a Disease?	469
SNYDER, FRANCIS	Ideologies of Competition in European Community Law	149
THORNTON, MARGARET	Equivocations of Conciliation: The Resolution of Discrimination Complaints in Australia	733
WILLIAMS, GLANVILLE	Which of you did it?	179

*This article was published in the January 1989 issue of the Review with an incorrect title. The Editorial Committee regrets this error.

REVIEW ARTICLES

DOUZINAS, COSTAS (co-author)	Thrashing in the Dwelling House	261
DUGDALE, A. D.	Consumer Justice: The Legal Profession and the Public Interest	722
DUXBURY, NEIL	Making Legal History	856
GIBSON, SUSIE	The Structure of the Veil	420
HARWOOD, MICHAEL	Gray: Elements of Land Law	272
MCVEIGH, SHAUN (co-author)	Thrashing in the Dwelling House	261
MONTGOMERY, JONATHAN	Medical Law in the Shadow of Hippocrates	566
WARRINGTON, RONNIE (co-author)	Thrashing in the Dwelling House	261
WIGHTMAN, JOHN	Reviving Contract	115

LEGISLATION

[Entries in **bold** type are the subject of separate notes or articles; other entries refer to legislation receiving substantial discussion or criticism elsewhere in this volume.]

Anti-Discrimination Act 1977 (Aus.-N.S.W.) 733
Asbestos Regulations 1969 561
Australian Security and Intelligence Organisation Act 1979 (Aus.) 808
Berne Copyright Convention 1886 369
Cable and Broadcasting Act 1984 385
Canadian Security Intelligence Act 1984 (Can.) 809
Children Act 1989 762
Children and Young Persons Act 1969, s.1(2) 764
Companies Act 1985, s.14 407
Companies (Insider Dealing) Act 1985, s.1 852
Convention on the Suppression of Terrorism (Council of Europe) 1977 588
Copyright Act 1956 369
Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 **369**
Criminal Damage Act 1971, s.1 240, 519
Criminal Justice Act 1988, Part VII **518**
Criminal Law (Jurisdiction) Act 1976 (Ire.) 592
Crown Prerogatives (House of Commons Control) Bill 1988 **837**
E.E.C. Directive 77/187 691
E.E.C. Regulation 1612/68 541, 632
Education Reform Act 1988 **215**
Employment Protection (Consolidation) Act 1978, s.81(2)(*a*) 251
Equal Opportunity Act 1984 (Aus.-S. Aus.) 733
Equal Opportunity Act 1984 (Aus.-Vic.) 733
Equal Opportunity Act 1984 (Aus.-W. Aus.) 733
European Convention on Human Rights (Council of Europe), article 5 703
article 10 391
Extradition Act 1965 (Ire.) 590
Extradition (European Convention on the Suppression of Terrorism) Act 1987 (Ire.) 607
Factories Act 1961 561
Family Law Reform Act 1969, s.7(2) 769
Forgery and Counterfeiting Act 1981 238
Housing Act 1980 662
Housing Act 1988 **661**
Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission Act 1986 (Aus.) 733
Interception of Communications Act 1985 812
Law of Property Act 1925 683
Matrimonial Homes Act 1983 110
Mental Health Act 1983, s.41 716
Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984, s.10 720
s.58 105
s.78 105
Prevention of Terrorism (Temporary Provisions) Act 1984, s.12 703
Racial Discrimination Act 1975 (Aus.) 733
Registered Designs Act 1949 374
Rent Act 1977 408, 557, 662
Sale of Goods Act 1979, s.14(2), (3) 246
Security Service Act 1989 **801**

Settled Land Act 1925 683
Sex Discrimination Act 1975, ss.22, 23 & 25 711
Sex Discrimination Act 1984 (Aus.) 733
Social Security Act 1980 66
Social Security Act 1986 **64**
Social Security (Unemployment, Sickness and Invalidity Benefit) Regulations 1983, reg. 7(1)(*e*) 93
Supplementary Benefits Act 1966 65
Supplementary Benefits Act 1976 65
Trade Descriptions Act 1968, s.1(1)(*a*) 246
Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment) Regulations 1981, reg. 5 694
reg. 8 691
Theft Act 1968, s.1 238
s.13 240
Treaty of Rome, article 3(*f*) 149
article 7 541
article 30 232
article 128 540
article 177 232, **622**
Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977 842
s.12(1)(*a*) 245
United States—United Kingdom Supplementary Extradition Treaty 1985 589

REPORTS

[Entries in **bold** type are the subject of separate notes or articles; other entries refer to reports receiving substantial discussion or criticism elsewhere in this volume.]

Broadcasting in the '90s: Competition, Choice and Quality (White Paper) (1988) **380**
Child Care and Family Services, The Law on (White Paper)(1987) 762
Child Care Law, Department of Health and Social Security Review of (1985) 762
Civil Justice Review, General Issues Paper (1987) 285
Consumer Protection, Final Report of the Malony Committee on (1962) 248
Contingency Fees (Green Paper) (1989) 285, **527**
Conveyancing by Authorised Practitioners (Green Paper) (1989) 285, **527**
Criminal Code, Draft, Law Commission Report (1988) 183
Exemption Clauses, First Report of the Law Commission on 248
Financing the B.B.C., Report of the Peacock Committee on (1986) 380
Government Legal Services, Review of (the Andrew Report) (1989) 528
Housing: The Government's Proposals (White Paper) (1987) 664
Intellectual Property and Innovation, White Paper (1986) 369
Justice, Ordinary. Legal Services and the Courts in England and Wales: A Consumer View, National Consumer Council Report (1989) **722**
Land, Transfer of: Trusts of Land, Report of the Law Commission (1989) **683**
Legal Profession, Report of the Marre Committee on the Future of ('A Time for Change' 1988) 298
Legal Profession, the Work and Organisation of (Green Paper) (1989) 285, **527**
Legal Services, Report of the (Benson) Royal Commission on (1979) 299
Multi-Disciplinary Partnerships and Allied Topics, Law Society Discussion Paper (1987) 326
National Curriculum 5–16, The, Consultation Document, Department of Education and Science (1987) 215
Restrictions on the Kind of Organisation through which Members of Professions may offer their Services, Office of Fair Trading (1986) 326
Social Security, Reform of (White Paper) (1985) 67

TABLE OF CASES

[Entries in **bold** type are the subject of separate notes or articles; other entries refer to cases receiving substantial discussion or criticism elsewhere in this volume.]

A.G. Securities v. Vaughan (1988) **408**
Anns *v.* Merton London Borough Council (1978) 204
Antoniades v. Villiers (1988) **408**
Att. Gen. v. Guardian Newspapers Ltd. (No. 2) (1988) **389**
Attorney General's Reference (No 1 1988) (1989) **851**

Batty *v.* Metropolitan Property Realisations Ltd. (1978) 204
Breckland Group Holdings Ltd. v. London & Suffolk Properties Ltd. (1988) **401**
British Transport Commission *v.* Gourley (1956) 551
Brogan v. U.K. (1988) (E.C.H.R.) 703
Brooker Settled Estates v. Ayers (1987) **408**
Brown v. Secretary of State for Scotland (1988) (E.C.J.) **540**

Casagrande *v.* Landeshauptstadt München (1974) (E.C.J.) 540
Chapman *v.* Honig (1963) 33
Chatterson *v.* Gerson (1981) 792
Chief Adjudication Officer v. Brunt (1988) **93**
CILFIT *v.* Ministry of Health (1982) (E.C.J.) 622
Commission of the European Communities *v.* France (1979) (E.C.J.) 161
Courtaulds Northern Spinning Ltd. v. Sibson (1988) **251**

D. & F. Estates Ltd. v. Church Commissioners (1988) **200**
Davies *v.* Sumner (1984) 246
Du Cros *v.* Lambourne (1907) 180

Estavest Investments Ltd. *v.* Commercial Express Travel Ltd. (1988) 559

Forchori *v.* Belgium (1983) (E.C.J.) 541
Foto-Frost *v.* Hauptzollamt Lübeck-Ost (1988) (E.C.J.) 637

Gisborne *v.* Burton (1988) 417
Gravier *v.* City of Liège (1985) (E.C.J.) 542
Gunton *v.* Richmond London Borough Council (1980) 23, 455

Hadjiloucas v. Crean (1988) **408**
Harris v. Wyre Forest District Council (1989) **841**
Hedley Byrne *v.* Heller (1964) 201
Hilton v. Plustitle Ltd. (1988) 418, **557**
Hill *v.* Parsons (1972) 450
Hodgson v. Trapp (1988) **550**

Irani *v.* Southampton and South East Hampshire Health Authority (1985) 458

Jones *v.* Lee (1980) 23, 456
Junior Books Ltd. *v.* Veitchi Co. Ltd. (1983) 200

Kashmir Kaur v. Gill (1988) **110**
Ketteman *v.* Hansel Properties Ltd. (1988) 396
Koppen *v.* Commissioners for Community Relations (1986) (Aus.-Fed. Ct.) 751

Litster v. Forth Dry Dock & Engineering Co. Ltd. (1989) **691**
London Congregational Union Inc. v. Harriss & Harriss (1988) **395**

MacMahon *v.* Department of Education and Science (1982) 541
Magnavision N.V. *v.* General Optical Council (1987) 632

Malloch *v.* Aberdeen Corporation (1971) 454
Marshall's Valve Gear Ltd. *v.* Manning Wardle Ltd. (1909) 404
McGlinchey *v.* Wren (1982) (Ire.) 595

Nurse v. Morganite Crucible Ltd. (1988) 561

Pirelli General Cable Works Ltd. *v.* Oscar Faber & Partners (1983) 395

Quinn *v.* Wren (1985) (Ire.) 597

R. *v.* A. I. Industrial Products Plc. (1987) 561
—— **v. Alladice (1988) 104**
—— *v.* BBC *ex p.* Lavelle (1983) 457
—— **v. Birmingham City Council, ex p. Equal Opportunities Commission (1989) 710**
—— *v.* East Berkshire Health Authority, *ex p.* Walsh (1984) 455
—— *v.* Gibson (1984) 195
—— **v. Gold and Schifreen (1988) 236**
—— *v.* Home Secretary, *ex p.* Northumbria Police Authority (1988) 826
—— *v.* Inner London Education Authority, *ex p.* Hinde (1985) 543, 631
—— *v.* Lane (1985) 194
—— *v.* Manning (1849) 179
—— *v.* Marion Russell (1987) 191
—— *v.* Panel on Take-overs and Mergers, *ex p.* Datafin (1987) 644
—— **v. Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain ex p. Association of Pharmaceutical Importers (1987) 232**, 628
—— **v. Samuel (1988) 104**

R & B Customs Brokers Co. Ltd. v. United Dominions Trust (1988) 245
Rank Xerox Ltd. v. Churchill (1988) 251
Ridge *v.* Baldwin (1964) 453
Riley *v.* Chief Adjudication Officer (1988) 95
Russell *v.* Fanning (1988) (Ire.) 597

Sandhu, *Re* (1985) 635
Secretary of State for Employment *v.* Spence (1986) 694
Shannon *v.* Fanning (1984) (Ire.) 596
Sidaway *v.* Bethlem Royal Hospital (1985) 790
Simaan General Contracting Co. *v.* Pilkington Glass Ltd. (No. 2) (1988) 396
Smith v. Eric S. Bush (1989) 841
Snook *v.* London & West Riding Investments Ltd. (1967) 559
Stevenson *v.* United Road Transport Union (1977) 454
Street *v.* Mountford (1985) 59, 408, 558

Taylor *v.* O'Connor (1971) 550
Toussaint *v.* Blue Cross and Blue Shield (1981) (U.S.A.—Cal.) 25

United Kingdom *v.* Commission of the European Communities (1988) (E.C.J.) 159

W v. Egdell (1988) 715
Wheeler *v.* Patel (1987) 699
Williams & Glyn's Bank Ltd. *v.* Boland (1981) 57

Yianni *v.* Edwin Evans & Son (1982) 848

BOOK REVIEWS

Adams and Brownsword: Understanding Contract Law 115
Arnaud: Dictionnaire Encyclopédique de Theorie et de Sociologie du Droit 577
Beale, Bishop and Furmston: Contract Cases and Materials 115
Bent, Schwaab, Conlin and Jeffrey: Intellectual Property Rights in Biotechnology Worldwide 282
Beyleveld and Brownsword: Law as a Moral Judgment 139
Cocks: Sir Henry Maine: A Study in Victorian Jurisprudence 856
Collier: Conflict of Laws 871
Collins: The Law of Contract 115
Corder (ed.): Essays on Law and Social Practice in South Africa 280
Elias and Ewing: Trade Union Democracy, Members' Rights and the Law 441
Fleming: The American Tort Process 729
Gray: Elements of Land Law 272
Hutchinson: Dwelling on the Threshold: Critical Essays on Modern Legal Thought 261
International Journal for the Semiotics of Law 142
Jacob: Doctors and Rules: A Sociology of Professional Values 566
Jaffey: Introduction to the Conflict of Laws 871
Jori and Pintore: Manuale di Teoria Generale del Diritto 577
Kennedy: Treat Me Right: Essays in Medical Law and Ethics 731
Lempert and Sanders: An Invitation to Law and Social Science—Desert, Disputes and Distribution 146
McCrudden (ed.): Women, Employment and European Equality Law 445
Rawlings: Law and the Electoral Process 869
Smith: Justification and Excuse in the Criminal Law 868
Stang-Dahl: Women's Law: An Introduction to Feminist Jurisprudence 420
Strivens (ed.): Merger Control in the EEC 145
Ziembinski (ed.): Polish Contributions to the Theory and Philosophy of Law 581

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
- Discretionary powers 64
- Education authorities 215
- Judicial review 64, 640
  - termination of employment, of 449
- Public inquiries 469

Alternative dispute resolution, see PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

BRITISH ISLES AND COMMONWEALTH
- Australia
  - discrimination 733
  - legal profession 326
  - legal services 326
  - security services 801
- Canada
  - legal profession 326
  - legal services 326
  - security services 801
- Ireland
  - extradition 585
- Northern Ireland
  - extradition 585

COMMERCIAL LAW
- Arbitration 480

COMPANY LAW
- Companies Act 1948
  - Article 80 of Table A 401
- Control of litigation 401
- Insider trading 851
- Minority shareholders rights 401
- Takeovers and mergers
  - City panel 640

COMPARATIVE AND FOREIGN LAW
- U.S.A.
  - labour law 22
  - legal profession 326
  - legal services 326

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
- Broadcasting controls 380
- Civil liberties
  - access to lawyer 104
- Education
  - legal framework 215
- European Convention on Human Rights 703

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—*cont.*
- Extradition
  - Ireland 585
  - political offenders 585
- Parliament
  - dissolution 837
- Prerogative
  - dissolution of Parliament 837
  - security service and 801
- Prevention of terrorism 703
- Security services 801

CONTRACT 115
- Exemption clauses
  - statutory regulation 245
- Implied terms 251

COURTS AND TRIBUNALS
- Court of Justice of the European Communities
  - references by English courts to 622

CRIMINAL LAW
- Accessories 179
- Accomplices 179
- Criminal damage 236
- Compensation for victims 518
- Theft 236

DISCRIMINATION
- Disputes, resolution of
  - conciliation 733
- Sex
  - education 710

EQUITY
- Remedies
  - injunction 389

EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES
- Common agricultural policy
  - Sheepmeat 149
- Community law
  - supremacy of 691
- Competition law
  - ideologies of 149
- Court of Justice of the European Communities
  - preliminary reference procedure 232, 622
- Discrimination
  - nationality 540
- Education
  - vocational training 540

EVIDENCE
Criminal cases
exclusion 104
right to silence 179
Documents
electronic transmission 649

FAMILY LAW
Children
care 762
Divorce
conciliation 480
Matrimonial home
rights in 110
Wardship 762

HOUSING LAW see also LANDLORD AND TENANT 272
Housing action trusts 661

INDUSTRIAL AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY
Breach of Confidence 236, 389, 715
Copyright 389
computer hacking 236
copyright
moral rights 369
Unregistered designs 369
INTERNATIONAL LAW
Human rights
European Convention 1
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1
United Nations
Human Rights Committee of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1

JURISPRUDENCE
Critical Legal Studies 42, 261
Dworkin 42
Feminist 420
Legal reasoning 42
Maine 856
Rights theory 42

LABOUR LAW, see also ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
Collective bargaining arbitration 480
Contract of employment
dismissal 22, 251, 449
implied terms 22, 251

LABOUR LAW—*cont.*
Contract of employment—*cont.*
injunction to restrain breach of 449
repudiatory breach 22
transfer of employees 691
wrongful dismissal 22, 449
Employment protection legislation
transfer of undertakings 691
Redundancy 251
Safety at work 561
Unfair dismissal 251
LAND LAW 272
Licences
tenancies, distinction 408
Settled land 683
Trusts for sale 683
LANDLORD AND TENANT
Assured shorthold tenancies 661
Assured tenancies 661
Eviction 661
Harassment 661
Rent Acts 408, 558, 661
Security of tenure 408, 558, 661
LEGAL AID 527, 722
LEGAL HISTORY
Maine 856
LEGAL PROFESSION 285, 326, 722
Contingency fees 285, 527
Divided profession 326
Reform of the law 285, 326, 527
Rights of audience 527
Solicitors
conveyancing by 285, 527
multi-disciplinary partnerships 326
LEGAL SCHOLARSHIP
Academic 352, 498
LEGAL SERVICES 285, 326, 527, 722
LEGAL THEORY
Legal research and 352

MEDICINE
Aids 790
Blood tests 790
Medical practice
medical law and 566
Medical treatment
consent to 790

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE
Alternative dispute resolution
choice of 480
conciliation 733
Privilege
professional 715

REMEDIES
Damages
social security payments, impact of 550
taxation and 550
Limitation of actions 395

SALE OF GOODS
Consumer protection 245
Implied terms 245
STATUTES AND STATUTORY INTERPRETATION
Interpretation
"obtained" 851
"process" 561

TORT, see also REMEDIES
Assault and battery
compensation for victims of crimes of violence 518
TORT—*cont.*
Negligence
duty of care 841
economic loss 200, 395
exclusion of liability 841
medical 790
valuers 841
Trespass in general
medical treatment 790
TRUSTS
Constructive trusts 389
Trusts for sale 683

WELFARE LAW
Social security
social fund 64
supplementary benefit 64
unemployment benefit 93

ANNOUNCEMENT

From January 1990 the publishers of the Modern Law Review will be Basil Blackwell Ltd. The Editorial Committee would like to thank Stevens and Sons Ltd. for their loyal support as publishers of the Review for over 40 years.

All correspondence concerning subscriptions for 1990 should be addressed to Basil Blackwell Ltd., 108 Cowley Road, Oxford OX4 1JF.